

1.11.1. Unstated Premise Problems

A. For each of the following arguments, describe a **validity counterexample** for the argument as stated. Then add an **unstated premise** that would block that validity counterexample.

1)

1. No one is both liberal and conservative.
2. If Peter reads Marx, then he's a liberal.

∴ Peter isn't a conservative.

2a)

1. If Jake's not back, then he's still in Santee.
2. If he's back, his car is parked in the driveway.

∴ Jake must still be in Santee.

2b) For the argument in (2a), what's wrong with proposing the following sentence as the missing premise?

[3B. Jake's not back.]

(That is: what principle would be violated by having this sentence as the missing premise?)

B. Put each of the following arguments into **standard form**, and describe a **validity counterexample** for the argument as stated. Then add an **unstated premise** that would block that validity counterexample.

1. Virgins don't lie, so Maureen must not be lying.¹
2. Since Kitty hates gothic architecture, she wouldn't like the Duomo di Milano.
3. Rex must be a hunter, since only hunters are members of the Duck Conservation Group.
4. Boston is the capital of Massachusetts. So the Massachusetts state house must be in Boston.
5. Since Peter reads Marx, he can't be a conservative.
6. **Ace:** Do you agree with Suki's view?
Rex: I would have to understand Suki's view in order to agree with it; so no, I don't agree with her view.
7. **Kitty:** Will Rex go on the training mission?
Doctor Slim: Going on the training mission requires getting up early every day for tough, extensive exercise programs. So there's no chance of Rex going on the training mission.

¹ Adapted from **Happy Days** Season 2, Episode 13 ("*Fonzie's Getting Married*"). See also 2.9.1. Problem 1.

C. Make an **argument map** for the following argument, then **add** any **unstated premises**.

1. Dr. Slim isn't an attorney, since all attorneys have passed the bar exam. But a paralegal who isn't an attorney must have ABA certification. So Dr. Slim is neither an attorney nor a paralegal.